

MURRAYFIELD COMMUNITY COUNCIL

Minutes of Ordinary Meeting  
held on Tuesday, 5 October 2021 at 7.30pm  
by Zoom  
Chair: J Yellowlees

Present: A Anderson, R Brown, D Dawson, J Forbes, P Gregson,  
B Knowles, J McDonough, E Robertson, M Stevens, H Whaley,  
J Yellowlees,  
*Ex officio:* Cllr Scott Douglas,  
In attendance: 5 members of the public,  
Apologies: R Beavis, N Macdonald, N Oldroyd, Cllr Gillian Gloyer, Cllr Frank  
Ross, Cllr Karen Doran, Cllr Claire Miller, Cllr Jo Mowat, Cllr  
Alasdair Rankin, Jeremy Balfour, MSP, Sarah Boyack, MSP, Miles  
Briggs, MSP, Foyso Choudhury, MSP, Alison Johnstone, MSP,  
Angus Robertson, MSP, Lorna Slater, MSP, Sue Webber, MSP,  
Christine Jardine, MP.

1. Welcome, Apologies and Additional Items

Apologies were received as above. The Chairman welcomed those in attendance.

The Chairman reported that:-

1.1 Cllr Scott Douglas had recently announced his decision not to stand for re-election at the Council elections in May 2022. He thanked Cllr Douglas for his support for, and work on behalf of, Murrayfield Community Council ("MCC") and marvelled at his ability to combine the heavy workload of a City Councillor with a full time job. The Chairman mentioned as a highlight of Cllr Douglas's involvement with MCC the combined and effective support which Cllrs Douglas, Gloyer and Ross had given to MCC's opposition to aspects of the Tor development.

1.2 Roseburn Primary School is displaying a banner which proclaims it to be a UNICEF Silver Rights Respecting School in which children's rights are learned, understood and lived.

1.3 Plans for Airbnb and other short-term let properties in Scotland to require a licence are to be examined by Holyrood's Local Government, Housing and Planning Committee. The proposed licensing scheme would impose regulations in a bid to tackle the growth of Airbnb-style rentals in popular tourist areas such as Edinburgh. J Forbes added that the Council are expected to publish their plans in relation to the scheme. MCC was aware that the residents of Roseburn Maltings had expressed concerns about the Airbnb properties there and the security implications.

1.4 Residents of Ormidale Terrace had contacted MCC to see whether the Council could do anything to alleviate the problems caused by a group of four foxes, who have been causing damage and mess and disturbing residents with their excessive nocturnal screaming. It was accepted that foxes are a feature of this part of the city.

**Cllr Douglas offered to take this problem up with the Environmental Health Department** and asked that the concerned residents contact him.

2. Approval of Minutes of Ordinary Meeting held on 31 August 2021 and Matters Arising

The Chairman reported as follows:-

- 2.1 Parkgrove Medical Practice, whose current practice area reaches as far east as Garscube Terrace, proposes to take no new patients from the Murrayfield area.
- 2.2 Scotland will play autumn tests at BT Murrayfield against Tonga on 30 October, Australia on 7 November, South Africa on 13 November and Japan on 20 November 2021.
- 2.3 Progress has been made regarding the Christmas tree to be installed on the Old Colt Bridge. J McDonough confirmed that a concrete container will not be required this year as a hole has been cut in the ground for the tree. The proposal for a permanent electricity supply has fallen foul of budget cuts and, as before, the supply will be taken from the nearby lamp post. John McNeill, who was formerly with the Council and consequently knows the personnel and understands the process, has been liaising with the Council. Heather Raeburn has arranged for St George's School to decorate the tree and, as a former art teacher, will herself lead the project. Roseburn Primary School will decorate the west side of the Bridge below the railings. The meeting approved the use of £250 of MCC funds to purchase canvas, paints and lights for the Bridge decorations. H Raeburn is keen for other community groups to run Christmas events on the Bridge.
- 2.4 S Kerr, the Chair of the Edinburgh Association of Community Councils, is pursuing the Edinburgh Partnership Improvement Plan, about which he addressed MCC at an earlier meeting.  
The Minutes were approved. Prop: J Yellowlees, Sec: J McDonough.

3 Councillor's Report

- 3.1 Kinellan Road and Ellersly Road traffic calming - J Forbes reported that the Operations Manager at the Council who had been invited to update MCC regarding the legacy projects (Ellersly Road pavement widening and Benjamin's Crossing) had not responded. At Cllr Ross's request the Road Safety Team had made available the data from their speed monitoring exercise and their conclusions. J Forbes said that he had discussed the findings with Rob Cormie, a neighbour in Ellersly Road to whom he gave credit for some key observations and analysis. He highlighted three disappointing conclusions:-

- (1) The data for Kinellan Road do not meet the established criteria for traffic calming measures such as humps, cushions or chicanes. (Ellersly Road likewise, but MCC has not sought such measures for that street.)
- (2) There are already 95 locations on the list for consideration and any new ones will be added to the bottom of the list.
- (3) Any investigation, which will not take place before the next financial year, will be limited to a review of existing speed limit signage and road markings and suitability for MVAS (motor vehicle activated signage). He did not believe these would bring any lasting benefit.

J Forbes expressed the view that the Road Safety Team's criteria for traffic calming measures, set out on 27 February 2020, are not fit for purpose for the following reasons:-

- (1) The only criterion which is considered is average speed. This is inappropriate because:-
  - a. On Kinellan Road more than 1 in 5 vehicles exceed 30 mph (10 mph over the posted speed limit). This is not clear from a simple average.
  - b. Averages assume all data points to be equally important. But the risk of injury or death to an unwary pedestrian is obviously greater at times of day when more are about, for example during the hour before or after school.
  - c. Risk of death to a pedestrian hit by a moving vehicle increases non-linearly with speed.

The focus needs to be on the 22% of road users who drive at the more deadly speeds (>30 mph), not on the average that lumps in all the compliant drivers.

- (2) According to the criteria of 27 February 2020, physical calming will be considered where 3 collisions causing personal injury have occurred in a 3 year period. The morality of waiting to accumulate 3 such accidents before even considering doing something is, to say the least, questionable.
- (3) With no injuries or deaths to fall back on, the average speed criterion for physical calming rises from 24 to 28 mph – in other words, when almost 50% of all drivers exceed 30 mph in a 20 mph zone. Isn't 22% bad enough?

J Forbes advised the meeting that there was one potential loophole which could perhaps be used. The Council's policy does allow that, because of the widely differing nature of the streets in the city, there might be exceptional circumstances in which, having considered all the factors, the Council's officers would decide that physical traffic calming measures were appropriate. He and R Cormie would now pursue building a case for Kinellan Road to be treated as having exceptional circumstances.

R Cormie pointed out that the data had disclosed 100 traffic movements a week which could cause instant death.

**Cllr Douglas undertook to chase the Operations Manager at the Council for a response to the request for him to attend the next MCC meeting.**

The Chairman intimated that the Living Streets Edinburgh Group are holding a free online public webinar on the theme of "Slower Speeds, Safer Streets". It will take place on Saturday 23 October, from 10 am to 12.45 pm. J Forbes confirmed that he will attend. The Chairman noted that the Group's media partner for the event is the Edinburgh Reporter and suggested that the Editor, Phyllis Stephen, might be a useful source of publicity for the Kinellan and Ellersly Roads initiative.

J McDonough asked Cllr Douglas whether he knew of any streets which had been classified as meeting the “exceptional circumstances” test. **Cllr Douglas undertook to ask Council officers.**

R Cormie mentioned Ravelston Park as an example of a street which has special measures, but is unlikely to have met the average speed criteria. J Forbes agreed but said that those measures would not suit Kinellan Road. Crarae Avenue was also mentioned. Cllr Douglas confirmed that the measures there had been put in place as a Council initiative as part of the Spaces for People project which prioritised areas near schools.

3.2 Roseburn Park conflicts between pedestrians and cyclists – J McDonough explained that, once the conversion of the toilet block to a café has been completed, people will queue in front of the café, making conflict between pedestrians and cyclists at this dangerous corner even more likely. He and his fellow trustees of the Friends of Roseburn Park (“FoRP”) are keen to find a solution. He felt that expert advice was required to find a solution which would be funded and implemented by the Council.

P Gregson explained that much work had been done on this in the past. FoRP had applied to Sustrans for a grant to employ a traffic consultant to advise on three options, but the application had been turned down because the Council had no plans to allocate funds to a solution. The three options were (1) re-route cyclists behind the toilet block, (2) move the shared path to remove the blind corner and (3) put in speed bumps.

**Cllr Douglas undertook to liaise with Cllr Ross in taking this forward.**

3.3 Low Emission Zone (“LEZ”) consultation – The Chairman reported that he had responded to the consultation and had made the point made by Cllr Gloyer that the LEZ would remove the problem of the most polluting vehicles to the areas just outside the LEZ. It had since come to light that only one third of the entry points into the LEZ would be monitored with cameras. Cllr Douglas said that his party had raised the point that the scheme would be ineffective without proper monitoring and the Council had undertaken to hold briefings with all the political groups. His would be briefed on 15 October.

3.4 Proposed floodlighting at St George’s School – A resident of Henderland Road thanked MCC and Cllr Douglas for their efforts in supporting the objections to this proposal. She reported that the School had written to most of the residents but had not addressed their concerns. It was clear that the School’s motivation was financial. She understood that there might be technical changes to the lighting data in the School’s planning application and elevation drawings had been requested but had not yet been produced. J Forbes confirmed that MCC had said in its submission that the lack of elevation drawings made the application defective, but none had yet been produced. It was agreed that this item would be kept on the agenda.

3.5 Safety around Roseburn Primary School – The Chairman reported that three new crossing patrol officers are now in place at the crossing beside the Murrayfield Bar, at the foot of Murrayfield Avenue and outside the School. A parent who was present at the meeting confirmed that the situation had improved, but Roseburn Place remains a dangerous rat run. She asked when the promised “School Streets” initiative, which MCC had been told by Cllr

Ross was going ahead, would be installed. **The Chairman undertook to ask Cllr Ross for an update.**

- 3.6 CCWEL and Rejuvenating Roseburn – H Whaley reported that the Finance Committee meeting on 7 October was expected to approve the award of the contract for the CCWEL to Balfour Beattie and work should start early in 2022. He confirmed his understanding that the Council is looking to the Town Centre Fund to provide the balance of the funding for the Rejuvenating Roseburn project. Cllr Douglas added that the A8 was due to be resurfaced and this will now be done at the same time as the CCWEL.
- 3.7 Blocked gullies and flooding – A Anderson confirmed that a number of gullies in Henderland Road, Coltbridge Terrace and Garscube Terrace have been inspected by the Council but have still to be cleared. **Cllr Douglas** added that he has been chasing the appropriate Council team about blocked gullies for more than three months but keeps getting the stock response that they are short staffed.  
**He undertook to continue to press them for action.**  
A Anderson reported that two holes which had been dug in Coltbridge Terrace and Henderland Road several months ago had been surrounded with barriers but had not been filled in. The Roseburn Primary School parent said that she had reported this several times. **Cllr Douglas** asked her to forward the Council reference to him and **undertook to follow this up.**
- 3.8 Pansy Walk Allotments – At the Chairman’s request **Cllr Douglas undertook to ask Cllr Ross for an update.**
- 3.9 Police incident at Roseburn Maltings – Cllr Douglas reported that the Police had responded to a report of an incident at Roseburn Maltings but, as their triangulated plotting of the location was inaccurate, they had knocked on the doors of several residents at 4 am and insisted on gaining entry. Some of the residents had been shaken by this experience. Cllr Douglas offered to pass on the details of anyone affected to PC Sam Davison so that he could speak to them.
- 3.10 Felling of tree at 10 Ravelston Park – Cllr Douglas reported that a protected tree had been taken down without permission about a year ago and the owners had failed to meet the time limit for planting a replacement. He intended to chase the Enforcement team to press for replacement planting.
- 3.11 Noise from Edinburgh Rugby stadium – Cllr Douglas reported that residents of Baird Grove had complained about noise from the Edinburgh Rugby stadium. Edinburgh Rugby are now going to install the sound barrier, which was part of the original design, but which had been omitted so that they could measure the noise levels without it.
- 3.12 Controlled Parking Zones proposals – Cllr Douglas reminded the meeting that these proposals have been held over until after the Council elections next year. Also held over is the proposal to trial match day parking permits for BT Murrayfield, Tynecastle and Easter Road. He intended to urge the Council to proceed with this trial now.

#### 4 Planning and Licensing

J Forbes reported as follows:-

4.1 37 Corstorphine Road – A status update on 28 August stated that the Reporter is drafting his report for submission to the Scottish Ministers. It is

not clear whether the Arup report has been received. J McDonough said that he understood that it has not and the Reporter is drafting his preliminary findings.

4.2 22 Haymarket Yards – The planning application is awaiting assessment. 12 public comments were made, of which 10 were objections. M Stevens confirmed that the residents of the Donaldson Area are happy that no access is to be taken from Devon Place and that the revised drawings show the building stepped back near the residential properties.

4.3 65 Ravelston Dykes Road – The applications for planning permission and Listed Building Consent for an extension to a listed building are awaiting assessment. A large number of objections has been received, but Historic Scotland do not object with regard to the listed building. MCC's objection regarding missing information on proposed tree felling in a Conservation Area has not been addressed by the applicant.

4.4 Woodland in Abinger Gardens – The Coltbridge and Wester Coates Conservation Area character appraisal states that this woodland is an essential feature which should be maintained. The application states that 13 trees, which are to be felled for sound arboricultural reasons, will not be replaced. As there is no opportunity to lodge objections with the Planning Department in these cases, J Forbes proposed writing to the applicant to urge them to undertake appropriate replacement planting. In answer to questions from J McDonough he confirmed that the total number of trees in the woodland is approximately 60-70 and the 13 trees in question are not the best specimens. **J Forbes undertook to draft a letter for MCC approval** and include a suggestion that, if finance is a constraint on replacement planting, the applicant might consider applying to the Million Tree City team for help.

4.5 Beechwood Mains milestone – J Riddell now has Listed Building Consent for the repair work, which will be undertaken by his contractor.

## 5 Police Report

The Chairman reported as follows:-

- 5.1 PC Sam Davison had visited the kebab shop on Roseburn Terrace, about which N Oldroyd had complained, to make the owner aware of the steps which should be taken to protect customers.
- 5.2 The Police had carried out Operation Close Pass in Roseburn Street and Balgreen Road. H Whaley added that, although Ravelston Dykes is a more dangerous road for cyclists, the Police had explained that it lacks suitable places for pulling drivers over for a “chat on the mat”.
- 5.3 The Police have launched the Herbert Protocol, which enables family members or carers of people with dementia, who are likely to go missing, to provide the Police with information to assist with a rapid response if that were to happen.
- 5.4 COP26 – PC Davison will be on duty at this event and may not be able to provide a report for the next MCC meeting.

## 6 Friends of Roseburn Park update

B Knowles reported as follows:-

- 6.1 The café steering group is finalising the tender documents. The designs for the conversion of the toilet block to a cafe have been agreed and finalised drawings will be available shortly.
- 6.2 FoRP obtained one tonne of mulch in September and volunteers have now mulched 24 trees. There are more to be done.
- 6.3 The wallflowers which were donated to the Park have all been planted in the planters.
- 6.4 FoRP are holding their AGM on Zoom on Wednesday, 27 October 2021 at 7.30 pm.  
J McDonough asked if anyone could recommend a contractor to carry out the toilet block conversion and requested that any recommendations be given to him or the Chairman.  
P Gregson said that FoRP were sorting out the water supply to the café and asked whether anyone had a Toby key. M Stevens appeared on screen with a Victorian Toby key a few minutes later!

## 7 Treasurer's Report

The Treasurer confirmed that there had been no transactions in the past month and the balance remained unchanged at £2,211. He expected to receive invoices for the plaque mentioned at Item 9.1 and the items for the decoration of the Old Colt Bridge mentioned at Item 2.3.

The Chairman mentioned that former MCC member George Douglas had proposed a plaque to commemorate the terminus of the route of a horse drawn tram from Newington to the Murrayfield railway bridge. One of the trams has been restored and can be seen at the Scottish Bus Museum at Lathalmond, Fife. The Chairman undertook to pursue this proposal.

## 8 Social Engagement

The meeting agreed that increasing social engagement is challenging. In the absence of R Beavis there was little to report. E Robertson had tried to interest the students of Craigmount High School in participating in MCC as a way to gain insight into the workings of local government, but without success.

The Chairman wondered whether a student of politics, local government, journalism or law might be interested in taking MCC as a case study for a thesis or dissertation.

The Chairman hoped that the increasing number of plaques might stimulate interest in MCC's activities.

## 9 Any Other Competent Business

- 9.1 The Chairman informed the meeting that the plaque in Roseburn Park honouring local artist Charles H Mackie would be unveiled by Pat Clark, a former local resident who had written a biography of the artist, on Wednesday, 10 November at 11.30 am. Dr Helen Scott, who curated the recent exhibition on Mackie at the City Art Centre, would also be invited. J McDonough asked the Chairman to pass this information to R Beavis and Rebecca Eccles for publication on social media.
- 9.2 J Forbes reported that Don Page, a resident of Westerlea, had been in touch with him about Mackie and sculptor Pilkington Jackson, both of whom had a connection with Westerlea. As Don Page was unable to be present, J Forbes

read out his contribution. D Page explained that the gardens at Westerlea were re-designed in 1914 by the architect Sir Robert Lorimer and, initially, they contained 3 statues, one a large centrepiece by Mackie and 2 others by Pilkington Jackson, one at either end of the gardens. Over the years the Mackie statue fell into decline, but was restored by the National Museum and is now on display there. One of the Pilkington Jackson statues disappeared. Phase 1 of the project which he and two neighbours are pursuing is to replace the missing statue and they are seeking ideas from interested sculptors. The remaining Jackson work is a life size bronze statue of a young woman. Originally she was holding a bird aloft in her right hand, but the bird has also disappeared. Phase 2 of the project will be to replace it. Mackie was not the only artist to have a studio in the Murrayfield area. Pilkington Jackson worked for some 15 years from Ravelston Elms at the top of Murrayfield Road. The Westerlea group are hoping that their project will contribute to the efforts of MCC in promoting the rich artistic heritage of the area.

- 9.3 The Chairman thanked M Stevens, Chair of the Donaldson Area Amenity Association, for providing the Association's newsletter. This will not be published on MCC's website as the Association is a subscription organisation.
- 9.4 Trees in Balgreen Road – R Brown reported that MCC had been contacted by a Balgreen resident to ask about lodging a request with the Council to have some trees reinstated on Balgreen Road. A number of trees have been lost in the past. Others have recently been marked with an 'X' and are to be re-surveyed following completion of the current fibre optic installation. B Knowles advised the meeting that the Million Tree City database contains an entry referring to the planting of trees in Balgreen Road. There is no detailed information.
- 9.5 The Roseburn Primary School parent who attended the meeting asked when work would start on the cycle link between Roseburn and the canal. The Chairman explained that this route is outside the MCC area. The latest information that he had was the granting in March of planning permission – see <https://scottishconstructionnow.com/article/edinburgh-approves-planning-for-roseburn-to-union-canal-path-link>. Neither he nor H Whaley had any up to date information on this.

10 Date of Next Meeting: Tuesday, 9 November 2021

It was decided that MCC will hold its AGM on Zoom immediately prior to the Ordinary Meeting on 9 November. The AGM will start at 7.30pm.

Subsequent meeting: 14 December 2021.

Dates in 2022 to be confirmed.

Minutes approved at meeting of 9 November 2021.